



**Office of Thrift Supervision**  
Department of the Treasury

*Scott M. Albinson*  
*Managing Director*

1700 G Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20552 • (202) 906-7984

October 27, 2003

**MEMORANDUM FOR:** CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICERS  
**FROM:** Scott M. Albinson   
**SUBJECT:** Independent Appraisal and Evaluation Functions

The Office of Thrift Supervision, Office of the Comptroller of the Currency, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation, and National Credit Union Administration (the agencies) are jointly issuing the attached statement on the independence of the collateral valuation process. The statement serves as a reminder to regulated institutions to maintain standards of independence as part of an effective real estate appraisal evaluation program (program). It applies to all real estate lending functions and real estate-related financial transactions originated or purchased by a regulated institution for its own portfolio or as assets held for sale. Institutions should review the statement in conjunction with OTS's appraisal regulation (12 CFR Part 564) and Thrift Bulletin 55a (Interagency Appraisal and Evaluation Guidelines).

The agencies' appraisal regulations address appraiser independence and require that an institution, or its agent, directly engage the appraiser. The only exception to this requirement is that an institution may use an appraisal prepared for another financial services institution, provided that the regulated institution determines that the appraisal conforms to the agencies' appraisal regulations and is otherwise acceptable. It is also important to ensure that the program is safeguarded from internal influence and interference from an institution's loan production staff. Individuals independent from the loan production area should oversee the selection of appraisers and individuals providing evaluation services.

To foster control and accountability, the agencies encourage an institution to use written engagement letters when ordering appraisals, especially for large, complex, or out-of-area commercial real estate properties. Even in small institutions when absolute lines of independence cannot be achieved, effective internal controls should be implemented to ensure that no single person has sole authority to render credit decisions involving loans on which they ordered or reviewed the appraisal or evaluation.

For further information regarding the statement, contact Debbie Merkle, Project Manager, Credit Risk Policy at (202) 906-5688.

Attachment

---

**Office of the Comptroller of the Currency  
Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System  
Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation  
Office of Thrift Supervision  
National Credit Union Administration**

---

## **INDEPENDENT APPRAISAL AND EVALUATION FUNCTIONS**

October 27, 2003

The Office of the Comptroller of the Currency (OCC), the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System (FRB), the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC), the Office of Thrift Supervision (OTS), and the National Credit Union Administration (NCUA) (the agencies) are jointly issuing this statement to address concerns identified during examinations about the independence of the collateral valuation process. This statement applies to all real estate-related financial transactions originated or purchased by a regulated institution for its own portfolio or as assets held for sale. It provides further clarification of, and should be reviewed in conjunction with, the agencies' appraisal and real estate lending regulations<sup>1</sup> and the *Interagency Appraisal and Evaluation Guidelines* (Guidelines).<sup>2</sup>

An institution's board of directors is responsible for reviewing and adopting policies and procedures that establish and maintain an effective, independent real estate appraisal and evaluation program (program) for all of its lending functions. The real estate lending functions include commercial real estate mortgage departments, capital market groups, and asset securitization and sales units. These independence concerns include the risk that improperly prepared appraisals may undermine the integrity of credit underwriting processes. More broadly, an institution's lending functions should not have undue influence that might compromise the program's independence.

### **Selecting Individuals to Perform Appraisals or Evaluations**

The Guidelines establish minimum standards for an effective program, including standards for selecting individuals who may perform appraisals or evaluations. Among other considerations, the selection criteria must provide for the independence of the individual performing the appraisal or evaluation. That is, the individual has neither a direct nor indirect, interest, financial or otherwise, in the property or transaction. Institutions also need to ensure that the individual

---

<sup>1</sup> OCC: 12 CFR 34, subparts C and D; FRB: 12 CFR 208 subpart E and appendix C, and 12 CFR 225 subpart G; FDIC: 12 CFR 323 and 12 CFR Part 365; OTS: 12 CFR Part 564, and 12 CFR 560.100, and 12 CFR 560.101; and NCUA: 12 CFR Part 722.5.

<sup>2</sup> The interagency guidelines may be found in: *Comptroller's Handbook for Commercial Real Estate and Construction Lending* for OCC; SR letter 94-55 for FRB; FIL-74-94 for FDIC; and Thrift Bulletin 55a for OTS. NCUA was not a party to the Guidelines; however, the NCUA applies the content to credit unions, when applicable.

selected is competent to perform the assignment. Consideration should be given to the individual's qualifications, experience, and educational background. Selection occurs when, based on an oral or written agreement, the individual accepts the assignment to appraise or evaluate a particular property. Moreover, appraisal or evaluation development work should not commence until the institution finalizes the selection process.

The agencies' appraisal regulations address appraiser independence and require that an institution, or its agent, directly engage the appraiser. The only exception to this requirement is that an institution may use an appraisal prepared for another financial services institution, provided that the institution determines that the appraisal conforms to the agencies' appraisal regulations and is otherwise acceptable. Independence is compromised when an institution uses an appraiser who is recommended by the borrower or allows the borrower to select the appraiser from the institution's list of approved appraisers.

Institutions may not use an appraisal prepared by an individual who was selected or engaged by a borrower. An institution's use of a borrower-ordered appraisal violates the agencies' appraisal regulations. Likewise, institutions may not use "readdressed appraisals" – appraisal reports that are altered by the appraiser to replace any references to the original client with the institution's name. Altering an appraisal report in a manner that conceals the original client or intended users of the appraisal is misleading and violates the agencies' appraisal regulations and the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP).

It is also important to ensure that the program is safeguarded from internal influence and interference from an institution's loan production staff. Individuals independent from the loan production area should oversee the selection of appraisers and individuals providing evaluation services. The agencies recognize that it may not be possible or practical for small institutions to separate the collateral valuation and loan production processes. To ensure independence, loan officials, officers or directors with the responsibility for ordering appraisals and evaluations should not have sole approval authority for granting the loan request.

When selecting and engaging individuals, an institution needs to identify the assignment and order the appropriate appraisal or evaluation, as discussed in the Guidelines. To foster control and accountability, the agencies encourage an institution to use written engagement letters when ordering appraisals, especially for large, complex, or out-of-area commercial real estate properties. An institution should include a copy of the written engagement letter in the permanent loan file. An appraiser may also incorporate an engagement letter in the appraisal report. The engagement letter confirms that the assignment was made in a manner that complies with the institution's procedures and the agencies' regulations and Guidelines.

### **Appraisal and Evaluation Compliance Reviews**

An institution's appraisal and evaluation program must maintain effective internal controls that promote compliance with program standards and the agencies' appraisal regulations and Guidelines. Internal controls should, among other criteria, confirm that appraisals and evaluations are reviewed by qualified and adequately trained individuals who are not involved in the loan production processes. The institution's standards for and the depth of such reviews

should reflect the risk of the transaction and the process through which the appraisal or evaluation is obtained. An institution should establish more in depth review procedures for appraisals of large, complex or out-of-area commercial real estate credits and for those appraisals and evaluations that are ordered by agents of the institution, such as loan brokers or another financial services institution.

Even in small institutions when absolute lines of independence cannot be achieved, effective internal controls should be implemented to ensure that no single person has sole authority to render credit decisions involving loans on which they ordered or reviewed the appraisal or evaluation. Further, lending officials, officers, or directors should abstain from any vote or approval involving loans for which they performed the appraisal or evaluation.

### **Supervisory Approach**

Examiners will review an institution's standards of independence, taking into consideration the size of the institution and the nature and complexity of its real estate-related activities. Examiners will consider whether policies and procedures are comprehensive and applied uniformly to all units engaging in federally related transactions.

If an institution suspects that a licensed or certified appraiser is violating applicable laws or USPAP, or is otherwise engaging in other unethical or unprofessional conduct, the institution should make referrals directly to the appropriate state appraiser regulatory authorities. Examiners finding evidence of unethical or unprofessional conduct, including improperly prepared appraisals or evaluations and readdressed appraisals, should forward their findings and their recommendations to their supervisory office for appropriate disposition and referral to the state appraiser regulatory authority, as necessary. Institutions and institution-affiliated parties, including lenders, staff and fee appraisers, are reminded that they could be subject to enforcement actions, which include removal/prohibition orders, cease and desist orders, and civil money penalties, for violations of the agencies' appraisal and real estate lending regulations.